

Scott Seaman Discusses the Importance of Securing Judicial Finality in COVID-19 Pandemic Insurance Coverage Rulings

Via Law360 Insurance Authority

In The News | 1 min read Jun 9, 2025

Scott Seaman, Chicago-based partner and Co-Chair of Hinshaw's Insurance Services Group, was quoted in a recent Law360 Insurance Authority article discussing a North Carolina federal district court's decision to uphold the finality of a judgment against policyholder Golden Corral in its pursuit of pandemic-related insurance coverage.

Seaman emphasized the critical role federal judges play in assessing COVID-19 business interruption claims such as this case. "Federal court judges generally are as capable as state court judges in ascertaining existing state law and in predicting how state supreme courts would rule on unsettled matters." He noted that federal courts across the country have correctly ruled on coverage issues and have accurately anticipated state appellate and Supreme Court decisions.

Seaman explained that upholding judgments prevents endless litigation and potential abuse of the legal system. He pointed out that Golden Corral had "ample opportunity" to present its arguments and must now abide by the final ruling. "The law is evolving, and there is no unfairness about holding parties to the judgment rendered in their case," he said. "In contrast, there is extreme unfairness to hold parties' judgments hostage to subsequent decisions rendered in other cases. This would interpose unworkable uncertainty and chaos in litigation."

He also commented on the procedural aspects of the case, discussing how North Carolina's lack of a formal mechanism for certifying questions to its Supreme Court did not significantly impact the outcome. "If anything, it is an expression of confidence in the ability of federal court judges to decide issues of North Carolina law," he said. While acknowledging that the timing of the state Supreme Court's later decision might have changed the result, Seaman concluded, "good and bad timing is a reality of life and litigation."

Read the full article (subscription may be required).

• Law360 Insurance Authority: "Virus Coverage Revival Loss Shows Importance Of Judicial Finality" (May 22, 2025)

Hinshaw & Culbertson LLP is a U.S.-based law firm with offices nationwide. The firm's national reputation spans the insurance industry, the financial services sector, professional services, and other highly regulated industries. Hinshaw provides holistic legal solutions—from litigation and dispute resolution, and business advisory and transactional services, to regulatory compliance—for clients of all sizes. Visit www.hinshawlaw.com for more information and follow @Hinshaw on LinkedIn and X.

Related People



Scott M. Seaman Partner **312-704-3699**

Related Capabilities

Bad Faith, Market Conduct & Extra-Contractual Liability

Insurance

Insurance Coverage Litigation & Counseling

Reinsurance

Related Locations

Chicago

Related Insights

Scott Seaman Discusses Wisconsin Supreme Court Ruling that Continues a Series of Appellate Decisions Favorable to Insurers in COVID-19 Business Interruption Claims

Scott Seaman Discusses Why a Rare Policyholder Victory in North Carolina Likely Won't Shift Insurers' Winning Streak in COVID-19 Business Interruption Litigation

Scott Seaman Discusses "Beginning of the End" for Policyholder COVID-19 Business Interruption Claims